



ATTORNEYS AND COUNSELORS AT LAW

COLUMBIA, SOUTH CAROLINA

Bonnie D. Shealy

October 28, 2008

1901 MAIN STREET, SUITE 1200 POST OFFICE BOX 944 COLUMBIA, SOUTH CAROLINA 29202

> (803) 779-8900 (803) 252-0724

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Mr. Charles Terreni, Chief Clerk of the Commission Public Service Commission of South Carolina Synergy Business Park, Saluda Building 101 Executive Center Drive Columbia, SC 29210

Time Warner Cable Information Services' Application to Amend its Certificate of Public Convenience & Necessity to Provide Telephone Services in the Service Area of Fort Mill Telephone Company d/b/a **Comporium Communications** Docket No. 2008-326-C

Dear Mr. Terreni:

Enclosed for filing please find Time Warner Cable Information Services' ("TWCIS") Reply to the Return of Fort Mill Telephone Company, d/b/a Comporium Communications to TWCIS Motion to Compel or, in the alternative, Motion in Limine. By copy of this letter we are serving the same on the parties of record. If you have any questions, please have someone on your staff contact me.

Very truly yours,

ROBINSON, McFADDEN & MOORE, P.C.

Bonnie D. Shealv

BDS/tch **Enclosures**

cc/enc:

Randall Dong, Hearing Examiner (via email & U.S. Mail)

Nanette S. Edwards, Esquire (via email & U.S. Mail) Jeffrey M. Nelson, Esquire (via email & U.S. Mail)

M. John Bowen, Jr. (via email & U.S. Mail) Margaret M. Fox (via email & U.S. Mail)

Sue-Ann G. Shannon, Esquire (via email & U.S. Mail)

C. Bradley Hutto, Esquire (via email)

Julie P. Laine, Group Vice President Regulatory (via email) Charlene Keys, Vice President & General Manager (via email)

In Re: Applic Information S Time Warner Public Conven Telephone Ser Telephone Co	ation of Time War ervices (South Car Cable to Amend it nience and Necessit vices in the Service mpany, d/b/a Com ons and for Alterna	ner Cable folina) LLC, d/b/a is Certificate of ty to Provide e Area of Fort Mill porium) PUBLIC SER) OF SOU	ORE THE VICE COMMI TH CAROLIN CR SHEET 2008-326-C	
(Please type or print Submitted by:) Bonnie D. Shealy	,	SC Bar Number	 :: 11125	-
		dden & Moore, P.C.	Telephone:	(803) 779-8900	
·	PO Box 944 Columbia, SC 29	0202	Fax: Other:	(803) 252-072	24
	This form is required f	ontained herein neither replace for use by the Public Service	es nor supplements the	-	of pleadings or other papers
 □ Emergency Relief demanded in petition □ Request for item to be placed on Commission's Agenda exped □ Other: □ INDUSTRY (Check one) NATURE OF ACTION (Check all that apply) 					
☐ Electric		Affidavit	Letter		Request
Electric/Gas		Agreement	Memorandui	m	Request for Certification
☐ Electric/Telecommunications		Answer	■ Motion		Request for Investigation
☐ Electric/Water		Appellate Review	Objection		Resale Agreement
Electric/Water/Telecom.		☐ Application	Petition		Resale Amendment
☐ Electric/Water/Sewer		☐ Brief	Petition for I	Reconsideration	Reservation Letter
Gas		Certificate	Petition for I	Rulemaking	Response
Railroad		Comments	Petition for R	ule to Show Cause	Response to Discovery
Sewer		Complaint	Petition to In	itervene	Return to Petition
□ Telecommunications		Consent Order	Petition to Inte	ervene Out of Time	Stipulation
☐ Transportation		□ Discovery	Prefiled Test	timony	Subpoena
☐ Water		Exhibit	Promotion		☐ Tariff
☐ Water/Sewer		Expedited Considerat	ion 🔲 Proposed Or	der	Other:
Administrative Matter		Interconnection Agreem	ent Protest		
Other:		Interconnection Amend	ment Publisher's A	Mffidavit	
		Late-Filed Exhibit	Report		

BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF SOUTH CAROLINA

Docket No. 2008-326-C

In Re: Application of Time Warner Cable Information
Services (South Carolina) LLC, d/b/a Time
Warner Cable to Amend its Certificate of Public
Convenience and Necessity to Provide
Telephone Services in the Service Area of
Fort Mill Telephone Company, d/b/a Comporium
Communications, and for Alternative Regulation

TIME WARNER CABLE'S REPLY TO THE RETURN OF FORT MILL TELEPHONE COMPANY TO TIME WARNER CABLE'S MOTION TO COMPEL OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, MOTION IN LIMINE

Pursuant to 26 S.C. Code Ann. Regs. 103-829 and other applicable rules of the South Carolina Public Service Commission, Time Warner Cable Information Services (South Carolina) LLC, d/b/a Time Warner Cable ("TWCIS") files this Reply to Fort Mill Telephone Company d/b/a Comporium Communications', ("Fort Mill") Return to Time Warner Cable's Motion to Compel or in the Alternative, Motion *In Limine*. TWCIS seeks in its motion to compel to require Fort Mill to provide certain information sought in discovery which Fort Mill has refused to provide. Rule 103-833 of this Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure allow TWCIS to obtain through interrogatories and requests to produce "[a]ny material relevant to the subject matter involved in the pending proceeding..." The information requested by TWCIS is relevant and Fort Mill should be required to produce it.

I. The Information Sought By Time Warner Cable Is Relevant.

In this proceeding TWCIS seeks to extend its existing authority to operate as a telephone utility into areas of South Carolina where Fort Mill is the incumbent local exchange carrier. The application is governed by S.C. Code Section 58-9-280(B). One of the items which the

Commission can review under Section 58-9-280 is whether "provision of the service will not adversely impact the availability of affordable local exchange service." Because of this provision, the effect of TWCIS' proposed entry upon the incumbent local exchange carrier, Fort Mill Telephone, and, therefore, Fort Mill's financial strength is entirely relevant to this proceeding. Accordingly, TWCIS is entitled to the discovery it seeks.

Section 58-9-280 has applied to every CLEC application filed and granted in South Carolina. It also applied to the previous applications TWCIS filed by which it obtained the authority under which it currently operates in South Carolina. In none of these previous proceedings has an issue been raised about whether the service proposed to be offered by the applicant will cause sufficient economic harm to the incumbent that the affordability of local exchange service will be affected. For this reason TWCIS approached Fort Mill with a request that Fort Mill clarify whether it would raise that issue in this proceeding. If Fort Mill would agree that it was not going to raise the issue, then the scope of discovery could be narrowed. However, Fort Mill has refused to respond to this request and state its position and instead has explicitly reserved the right to raise the issue of whether TWCIS's entry into their service territory will adversely impact the availability of local exchange service. Accordingly, unless and until Fort Mill confirms that it will raise as an issue and argue that TWCIS' entry into its territory will adversely affect Fort Mill and, as a result, the affordability of local service, Fort Mill must be required to produce the financial information requested in the TWCIS discovery requests.

II. The Annual Reports Produced By Fort Mill Are Insufficient.

Fort Mill argues in its Return that the TWCIS motion should be denied because Fort Mill produced copies of its publicly available Annual Reports filed with ORS and this Commission.

In the first place that argument ignores the scope of discovery – TWCIS is entitled to receive

information and documents relevant to the issues in the proceeding, not information which Fort Mill is willing to give. In addition, the Annual Reports are not a sufficient source of information about the finances of Fort Mill and the other incumbent local exchange carriers.

TWCIS has begun to review the Annual Reports of Fort Mill and the other five companies with which Fort Mill is coordinating its efforts. That review raises questions about the information shown in the Annual Reports and demonstrates why TWCIS needs more detailed and specific financial information.

- It appears that some of the six ILECs classify revenues differently from others. For example, for 2007 Comporium company PBT Telecom, Inc. reported "Total Revenues" of \$18,754,047 and reported no "Non-Operating Income", while Comporium company Rock Hill Telephone Company reported "Total Revenues" of \$39,696,228 with an additional \$27,888,178 in "Non-Operating Income".
- None of the Annual Reports of the six ILECs separately report revenues they receive
 from the federal or state universal service funds. While the six ILECs have produced that
 information in response to discovery requests, Time Warner Cable needs to know where
 and how those USF revenues are reflected in the Annual Reports.
- Farmers Telephone Cooperative reports \$103,695,603 in year—end retained earnings on Schedule 3 to its 2007 Annual Report. That Schedule also shows that Farmers started 2007 with \$125,668,581 in retained earnings. Changes during the year include: a "Miscellaneous" debit of \$48,304,342; a "Miscellaneous" credit of \$23,607,849; an "Other" credit of \$27,209,815; and an "Other" credit of \$76,485,788. Enormous sums of money are moving around on the Farmers balance sheet with absolutely no explanation in its Annual Reports.

These examples are given not to assert that the companies are failing to properly report their finances, but rather to show that the Annual Reports are insufficient sources of information for TWCIS to use to respond to Fort Mill's expected arguments regarding the effects of TWCIS' proposed entry into its territory. Accordingly, Fort Mill's argument that the Annual Reports are sufficient should be rejected and it should be ordered to produce the financial information requested by TWCIS.

Dated this 28th day of October, 2008.

ROBINSON, MCFADDEN & MOORE, P.C.

By

Frank R. Ellerbe, III

Bonnie D. Shealy

1901 Main Street, Suite 1200

Post Office Box 944

Columbia, SC 29202

Telephone: (803) 779-8900 fellerbe@robinsonlaw.com

bshealy@robinsonlaw.com

and

C. Bradley Hutto, Esquire

Williams & Williams

Post Office Box 1084

Orangeburg, South Carolina 29115

cbhutto@williamsattys.com

Telephone

803-534-5218

Facsimile

803-536-6544

Attorneys for Time Warner Cable Information Services, (South Carolina), LLC

BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF SOUTH CAROLINA DOCKET NO. 2008-326-C

In Re:)
Application of Time Warner Cable Information Services (South Carolina) LLC, d/b/a Time Warner Cable to Amend its Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity to Provide Telephone Services in the Service Area of Fort Mill Telephone Company and for Alternative Regulation) CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE)
	/

This is to certify that I, Leslie Allen, a legal assistant with the law firm of Robinson, McFadden & Moore, P.C., have this day caused to be served upon the person(s) named below **Time Warner Cable's Reply to the Return of Fort Mill Telephone Company to Time Warner Cable's Motion to Compel or, in the alternative, Motion in Limine** in the foregoing matter by causing a copy of same to be place in the U.S. Mail in an envelope addressed as follows:

Nanette S. Edwards, Esquire Jeffrey M. Nelson, Esquire Office of Regulatory Staff P.O. Box 11263 Columbia, SC 29211 M. John Bowen, Jr. Esquire Margaret M. Fox, Esquire McNair Law Firm, PA P.O. Box 11390 Columbia, South Carolina 29211

eslie allen

Dated at Columbia, South Carolina this 28th day of October, 2008.

Leslie Allen